Culture and Rights
Anthropological Perspectives

Do people everywhere have the same, or even compatible, ideas about multiculturalism, indigenous rights or women’s rights? The authors of this book move beyond the traditional terms of the universalism versus cultural relativism debate. Through detailed case studies from around the world (Hawai‘i, France, Thailand, Botswana, Greece, Nepal and Canada) they explore the concrete effects of rights talk and rights institutions on people’s lives.

JANE K. COWAN is a senior lecturer in social anthropology in the School of Cultural and Community Studies at the University of Sussex. Her publications include Dance and the Body Politic in Northern Greece (1990, Winner of the Chicago Folklore Award 1991), an edited volume, Macedonia: The Politics of Identity and Difference (2000) and numerous articles on gender relations, ritual, popular music, the politics of ‘tradition’ and the formation of complex identities in contemporary Greece.

MARIE-BENEDITCE DEMBOUR is a lecturer in law in the School of Legal Studies at the University of Sussex. Her recent publications include Recalling the Belgian Congo: Conversations and Introspection (2000) and a number of articles that reflect her interests in human rights, identity and migration in Europe. She is now working on a project entitled ‘Problematising Human Rights: the European Convention in Question’.

Culture and Rights

*Anthropological Perspectives*

*Edited by*

Jane K. Cowan, Marie-Bénédicte Dembour and Richard A. Wilson
To Jacques Vanderlinden
# Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>List of contributors</th>
<th>page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Preface</td>
<td>xiii</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1 Introduction 1

**Part I: Setting universal rights** 27

2 Changing rights, changing culture 31  
   SALLY ENGLE MERRY

3 Following the movement of a pendulum: between universalism and relativism 56  
   MARIE-BENEDICTE DEMBOUR

4 Imposing rights? A case study of child prostitution in Thailand 80  
   HEATHER MONTGOMERY

5 Gendering culture: towards a plural perspective on Kwena women’s rights 102  
   ANNE GRIFFITHS

6 Between universalism and relativism: a critique of the UNESCO concept of culture 127  
   THOMAS HYLLAND ERIKSEN

**Part II: Claiming cultural rights** 149

7 Ambiguities of an emancipatory discourse: the making of a Macedonian minority in Greece 152  
   JANE K. COWAN

8 From group rights to individual rights and back: Nepalese struggles over culture and equality 177  
   DAVID N. GELLNER
Contents

9 Advancing indigenous claims through the law: reflections on the Guatemalan peace process
   RACHEL SIEDER AND JESSICA WITCHELL

10 Rights as the reward for simulated cultural sameness: the Innu in the Canadian colonial context
   COLIN SAMSON

Index
Contributors

JANE K. COWAN is a senior lecturer in social anthropology in the School of Cultural and Community Studies at the University of Sussex. Her publications include *Dance and the Body Politic in Northern Greece* (1990, Winner of the Chicago Folklore Award 1991), an edited volume, *Macedonia: The Politics of Identity and Difference* (2000), and numerous articles on gender relations, ritual, popular music, the politics of ‘tradition’ and the formation of complex identities in contemporary Greece. Her current work on the League of Nations’ interwar supervision of minorities treaties traces the changing ways cultural difference has been defined, contested and regulated in the southern Balkan region.

MARIE-BENEDICTE DEMBOUR is a lecturer in law in the School of Legal Studies at the University of Sussex. She also holds a doctorate in social anthropology. Her publications include *Recalling the Belgian Congo: Conversations and Introspection* (2000) and a number of articles that reflect her interests in human rights, identity and migration in Europe. She is now working on a project entitled ‘Problematising Human Rights: the European Convention in Question’.

THOMAS HYLLAND ERIKSEN is a professor of social anthropology at the University of Oslo and has carried out field research in Mauritius and Trinidad. His publications in English and Norwegian include textbooks, monographs and essays, often with a focus on identity politics and globalisation. His most recent books are *Charles Darwin* (1997), *Common Denominators* (1998), *Ambivalens og Fundamentalisme*, with Oscar Hemer (1999), and *Egoisme*, co-edited with Dag O. Hessen (1999).

DAVID N. GELLNER is a reader in social anthropology in the Department of Human Sciences at Brunel University, London. His publications include *Monk, Householder, and Tantric Priest: Newar Buddhism*

ANNE GRIFFITHS is a reader in law at Edinburgh University. Her specialist interests include comparative family law (Scotland, Botswana and the USA), anthropology of law, and gender and law. She has carried out fieldwork in Botswana over an eight-year period, the results of which are detailed in her book In the Shadow of Marriage: Gender and Justice in an African Community (1997). She is also co-author of a book on family law in Scotland. She has recently worked as a consultant on the Women and Law in Southern Africa Research Project for its research phase on ‘Delivering Justice’. Her current research involves a comparative study of ‘The Child’s Choice in Care Proceedings’, in Glasgow and a county in New York state, funded by the Annenberg Foundation in the USA.


COLIN SAMSON is a lecturer in sociology at the University of Essex, where he is a Director of the MA in Native American Studies. He has been working in the Innu communities of Sheshatshiu and Utshimassits, Labrador, since 1994. He is co-author of *Canada’s Tibet: the Killing of the Innu*, a human rights report commissioned by Survival International, and has written several scholarly articles on dispossession and land claims. In the spring of 1999 he worked for the Sheshatshiu Innu Band Council and produced a report on the impact of Euro-Canadian schooling. He also maintains interests in, and has published works on, Native American literature, cultural studies and medical sociology.

RACHEL SIEDER is a senior lecturer in politics at the Institute of Latin American Studies, University of London, where she teaches courses in comparative politics and in human rights. She is also an associate fellow at FLASCO Guatemala, where she is involved in research on indigenous customary law and legal reform. Her books include *Central America: Fragile Transition* (1995), *Derecho consuetudinario y transición democrática en Guatemala* (1996), and *Guatemala After the Peace Accords* (1998). She is currently working on a historical analysis of law and citizenship in Guatemala.

RICHARD A. WILSON is a reader in social anthropology at the University of Sussex. He has studied human rights and informal justice in countries such as South Africa and Guatemala which have moved from authoritarian and repressive regimes towards more democratic political dispensations. His books include a monograph on an ethnic revivalist movement in Guatemala, *Maya Resurgence in Guatemala* (1995), and an edited collection, *Human Rights, Culture and Context: Anthropological Perspectives* (1997). His recent ESRC-funded research investigated reconciliation in South Africa, leading to the monograph *The Politics of Truth and Reconciliation in South Africa* (2000). He is the editor of the journal *Anthropological Theory*.

JESSICA WITCHELL works as a development education worker at Reading International Solidarity centre, using participatory learning and action (PLA) methodology to facilitate an understanding of global issues in a local context. She has also led a participatory research project in Nepal exploring local health practices, which culminated in the publication of a poster and booklet for use in Nepali adult education classes.